## STATE OF VERMONT PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION

Case No. 8880

Joint Petition of NorthStar Decommissioning Holdings, LLC, NorthStar Nuclear Decommissioning Company, LLC, NorthStar Group Services, Inc., LVI Parent Corporation, NorthStar Group Holdings, LLC, Entergy Nuclear Vermont Investment Company, LLC and Entergy Nuclear Operations, Inc., and any other necessary affiliated entities to transfer ownership of Entergy Nuclear Vermont Yankee, LLC, and for certain ancillary approvals, pursuant to 30 V.S.A. §§ 107, 231, and 232

Order entered: 06/11/2018

# ORDER RE: CERTAIN REQUESTS AND CONFIDENTIAL TREATMENT OF NORTHSTAR FINANCIAL STATEMENTS

## Motion of NorthStar Petitioners for Protective Order

On May 21, 2018, the NorthStar Petitioners<sup>1</sup> filed a motion with the Vermont Public Utility Commission ("Commission") for a protective order related to the 2017 financial statements of NorthStar Group Holdings, LLC and NorthStar Group Services, Inc. These financial statements were covered by a record request made by the Commission on May 11, 2018, during the evidentiary hearings in this case. As the NorthStar Petitioners note in their motion, the Commission previously determined in its Protective Order for Prefiled Evidence of January 11, 2018 (the "Protective Order") that a *prima facie* case had been made for confidential treatment of redacted information concerning NorthStar financial statements and financial data that were discussed or included in certain prefiled testimony of the Vermont Department of Public Service. None of the other parties objected or otherwise responded to the motion.

The Commission concludes in this Order that the NorthStar Petitioners have similarly made a *prima facie* case that confidential treatment of the 2017 financial statements of North

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The NorthStar Petitioners are NorthStar Decommissioning Holdings, LLC, NorthStar Nuclear Decommissioning Company, LLC, NorthStar Group Services, Inc., LVI Parent Corporation, and NorthStar Group Holdings, LLC.

Case No. 8880 Page 2

Star Group Holdings, LLC and NorthStar Group Services, Inc. is warranted. Consistent with the Protective Order, and subject to its terms and conditions, such financial statements shall be submitted and kept under seal until 90 days after the closing of the acquisition of Entergy Nuclear Vermont Yankee, LLC ("ENVY") by NorthStar Decommissioning Holdings, LLC or, if the acquisition does not close, until January 11, 2025.

### Response of NorthStar Petitioners to record request for other financial statements

During the evidentiary hearings, the Commission also requested financial statements for three other companies, JFL-NGS Partners, LLC; JFL-NGS Holdings, LLC; and JFL-GP Investor IV, LLC, that would indirectly own the renamed ENVY following the proposed acquisition.<sup>2</sup> In a response to this record request filed on May 25, 2018, the NorthStar Petitioners stated that JF Lehman & Co. "does not maintain financial statements for the pass-through investment entities it established for ownership of NorthStar Group Holdings, LLC and its subsidiaries."

The Commission requests that the NorthStar Petitioners confirm that no audited or unaudited financial statements exist for JFL-GP Investor IV, LLC, JFL-NGS Holdings, LLC, or JFL-NGS Partners, LLC and also requests that the NorthStar Petitioners advise the Commission as to whether investors in each of such companies have received any financial statements or financial reports related to any of these companies. To the extent that investors in JFL-GP Investor IV, LLC, JFL-NGS Holdings, LLC, or JFL-NGS Partners, LLC have received such financial statements or financial reports, the Commission requests that the NorthStar Petitioners provide copies of such statements or reports to the Commission. The NorthStar petitioners shall respond to this request in the form of additional supplemental prefiled testimony by June 21, 2018.

#### Exhibit JP-SES-19: NRC Filing of May 21, 2018

On May 23, 2018, the Joint Petitioners<sup>3</sup> filed with the Commission the supplemental prefiled testimony of Scott State together with a copy of a letter to the U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission dated May 21, 2018, which was filed as exhibit JP-SES-19 (the "NRC Letter").<sup>4</sup> In

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Tr. (5/11/18) at 7 and 35.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> The Joint Petitioners are the North Star Petitioners and Entergy Nuclear Vermont Investment Company, LLC and Entergy Nuclear Operations, Inc.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> In their cover letter, the joint petitioners asked whether the Commission would prefer in future similar circumstances that explanatory information be conveyed in the form of a letter rather than prefiled testimony. The

Case No. 8880 Page 3

footnotes to enclosures 1, 2, and 3 of attachment 2 to the NRC Letter, the Commission notes the following statement: "Beginning NDT Balance of \$513 million is the minimum pre-tax balance required pursuant to MIPA/DCAA."

The Joint Petitioners are requested to reconcile in the form of supplemental prefiled testimony the statement in the footnotes regarding the minimum required NDT balance of \$513 million with the testimony of Michael Twomey during the evidentiary hearing that under the MIPA the combined balance of the NDT and SRT at closing has to be at least \$538 million (which could result in an NDT balance at closing of less than \$513 million):

I think one way to think about it, as the juxtaposition of the MOU requirements and the contractual requirements is that the minimum balance has to be 538. We know there will be 60 million in the SRT. So there would have to be at least 478 million in the NDT.<sup>5</sup>

The Joint Petitioners shall provide such explanatory supplemental prefiled testimony by June 21, 2018.

#### June 1 Letter re Alternative Approach to Tax Issue

On June 1, 2018, the Joint Petitioners filed a letter with the Commission describing an alternative approach the Joint Petitioners have developed to provide comfort to the North Star Petitioners in light of the notification from the Internal Revenue Service that it will not issue the requested private letter concerning the tax treatment of the proposed transactions. The Commission notes that Entergy Nuclear Vermont Yankee, LLC ("ENVY") now plans to transfer certain excluded assets to another Entergy affiliate as early as this month. The Commission requests that the Joint Petitioners file a letter with the Commission by June 21, 2018, that includes a brief description of the excluded assets, in addition to the Governor Hunt House, that are being transferred by ENVY to the affiliate.

SO ORDERED.

Dated at Montpelier, Vermont, this	11th day of June, 2018	
	)	PUBLIC UTILITY
The state of the s	Margaret Cheney	Commission
	and former	OF VERMONT
	Sarah Hofmann )	

OFFICE OF THE CLERK

Filed: J

June 11, 2018

Attest:

Clerk of the Commission

Notice to Readers: This decision is subject to revision of technical errors. Readers are requested to notify the Clerk of the Commission (by e-mail, telephone, or in writing) of any apparent errors, in order that any necessary corrections may be made. (E-mail address: <a href="mailto:puc.clerk@vermont.gov">puc.clerk@vermont.gov</a>)

#### PUC Case No. 8880 - SERVICE LIST

## Parties:

William James Brotherton Abenaki Nation of Missisquoi 100 Grand Avenue Swanton, VT 05488 william@brothertonlaw.com (for Abenaki Nation of Missisquoi)

Lawrence Christopher Campany Windham Regional Commission 139 Main Street Suite 505 Brattleboro, VT 05301 ccampany@windhamregional.org (for Windham Regional Commission)

David G Carpenter
Facey Goss & McPhee PC
PO Box 578
RutlandRutland, VT 05702
dcarpenter@fgmvt.com

(for Town of Vernon Planning and Economic Development Commission)

Nathaniel Custer Wilmer Cutler Pickering Hale & Dorr, LLP 1875 Pennsylvania Avenue NW Washington, DC 20006 nathaniel.custer@wilmerhale.com (for Vermont Department of Public Service)

Richardson P Daniel Tarrant, Gillies & Richardson P.O. Box 1440 Montpelier, VT 05601 drichardson@tgrvt.com (for Entergy Nuclear Vermont Investment Company, LLC) (for Entergy Nuclear Operations, Inc.)

Joshua Diamond Vermont Office of the Attorney General 109 State Street Montpelier, VT 05609-1001 joshua.diamond@vermont.gov (for Vermont Office of the Attorney General)

William Driscoll Associated Industries of Vermont wdriscoll@aivt.org (for Associated Industries of Vermont)

James Dumont PO Box 229

Bristol, VT 05443

(for New England Coalition on Nuclear Pollution, Inc.)

dumont@gmavt.net

Felicia H. Ellsworth

(for Vermont Department of Public Service)

Wilmer, Cutler, Pickering, Hale and Dorr, LLP

60 State Street Boston, MA 02109

Felicia.Ellsworth@wilmerhale.com

Jordan Gonda

(for Vermont Agency of Natural Resources)

Vermont Agency of Natural Resources

1 National Life Drive

Davis 2

Montpelier, VT 05620

Jordan.Gonda@vermont.gov

Mark Gordon

(for Vermont Department of Public Service)

Wilmer Cutler Pickering Hale & Dorr, LLP

60 State Street

Boston

Boston, MA 02109

mark.gordon@wilmerhale.com

Bonnie Heiple

(for Vermont Department of Public Service)

Wilmer, Cutler, Pickering, Hale and Dorr, LLP

60 State Street

Boston, MA 02109

Bonnie.Heiple@wilmerhale.com

Richard Holschuh

Elnu Abenaki Tribe

117 Fuller Drive

Brattleboro, VT 05301

rich.holschuh@gmail.com

Robert C. Kirsch

(for Vermont Department of Public Service)

(for Elnu Abenaki Tribe)

Wilmer, Cutler, Pickering, Hale and Dorr, LLP

60 State Street

Boston, MA 02109

Robert.Kirsch@wilmerhale.com

Sandra Levine, Esq.
Conservation Law Foundation
15 East State Street
Suite 4
Montpelier, VT 05602
slevine@clf.org

(for Conservation Law Foundation)

Christopher Looney WilmerHale 60 State Street Boston, MA 02109 christopher.looney@wilmerhale.com

(for Vermont Department of Public Service)

John Marshall, Esq. 90 Prospect Street P.O. Box 99 Saint Johnsbury, VT 05819-0099 jmarshall@drm.com (for Entergy Nuclear Vermont Investment Company, LLC) (for Entergy Nuclear Operations, Inc.)

Jonathan B. Oblak Quinn Emanuel Urquhart & Sullivan, LLP 51 Madison Avenue, 22nd Floor New York, NY 10010 jonoblak@quinnemanuel.com (for Entergy Nuclear Vermont Investment Company, LLC) (for Entergy Nuclear Operations, Inc.)

James Porter, Esq.
Vermont Department of Public Service
112 State St
Montpelier, VT 05620
james.porter@vermont.gov

(for Vermont Department of Public Service)

Janet Rasmussen Town of Vernon Planning Commission 52 Southern Heights Drive Vernon, VT 05354 janetrasmussen1@aol.com (for Town of Vernon Planning and Economic Development Commission)

Ingrid Scholze, Esq.
Quinn Emanuel Urquhart & Sullivan, LLP
51 Madison Avenue, 22nd Floor
New York, NY 10010
ingridscholze@quinnemanuel.com

(for Entergy Nuclear Vermont Investment Company, LLC) (for Entergy Nuclear Operations, Inc.) Roger Longtoe Sheehan Elnu Abenaki Tribe Elnu Tribe Headquarters 5243 VT Route 30 Jamaica, VT 05343 gitceedadann@yahoo.com (for Elnu Abenaki Tribe)

Ellyde R. Thompson Quinn Emanuel Urquhart & Sullivan LLP 51 Madison Avenue 22nd Floor New York, NY 10010 ellydethompson@quinnemanuel.com (for Entergy Nuclear Vermont Investment Company, LLC) (for Entergy Nuclear Operations, Inc.)

Sanford I. Weisburst Quinn Emanuel Urquhart & Sullivan, LLP 51 Madison Avenue 22nd Floor New York, NY 10010 sandyweisburst@quinnemanuel.com (for Entergy Nuclear Vermont Investment Company, LLC) (for Entergy Nuclear Operations, Inc.)

Joslyn L. Wilschek, Esq. Wilschek Iarrapino Law Office, PLLC 35 Elm Street Suite 200 Montpelier, VT 05601 Joslyn@ilovt.net (for NorthStar Group Holdings, LLC) (for LVI Parent Corp.) (for NorthStar Decommissioning Holdings, LLC) (for NorthStar Group Services, Inc.) (for NorthStar Nuclear Decommissioning Company, LLC)

Jeffrey C. Wimette International Brotherhood of Electrical Workers, Local 300 3 Gregory Drive South Burlington, VT 05403 jcw@ibewlocal300.org (for International Brotherhood of Electrical Workers, Local 300)

John Zaikowski Vermont Agency of Natural Resources 1 National Life Drive Davis 2 Montpelier, VT 05620-3901 John.Zaikowski@vermont.gov (for Vermont Agency of Natural Resources)